REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION FOR THE EVALUATION OF MASTER'S EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY <u>"MEDICINE"</u> ASFENDIYAROV KAZNMU TO THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION MASTER'S DEGREES PROGRAMME IN MEDICAL AND HEALTH PROFESSIONS EDUCATION period of external expert evaluation: 22.12.-24.12.2020

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 23 dated 07.12.2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes in the specialty "Medicine" (bachelor's, master's, doctoral PhD) Asfendiyarov KazNMU in the following composition:







Chairman of the External Expert Commission

KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA BOLATOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Children's Diseases NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, winner of the medal V.G. Leibniz (2012), M. Pettenkofer (2014) European Scientific Society, Accredited independent expert on the assessment of the quality of medical services.

Foreign expert

OLEG MIKHAILOVICH URYASIEV, MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with courses of Endocrinology, General Physiotherapy, Clinical Pharmacology, Occupational Diseases and Military Field Therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I. P. Pavlov, Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation.

National Academic Expert

KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA,

Ph.D., Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities

Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHOZ" Accredited independent expert in assessing the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairman of the Board of the Regional Public Organization "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations".





ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Public Health of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", training coach for MSHI in the Western region.

Expert - representative of undergraduates

KHUSAINOVA ZHANAR ZHANATBEKOVNA, master's student of 2 years of study in the specialty " Medicine» JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education", doctor of ultrasound diagnostics

ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department NU "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care " tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the Master's degree programme in the specialty "Medicine" Asfendiyarov KazNMU for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC for further improving the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation Asfendiyarov KazNMU and the Master's programme in the specialty "Medicine"

In 2018, the University was reorganized into a non-profit joint stock company (NJSC) in accordance with the resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5, 2018 No. 166) and received the status of a research university (resolution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 12, 2018).





Educational activities in NJSC KazNMU are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319 "On Education", "On Approval of the State Programme for the Development of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020 - 2025", "State Programme for the Development of Education of the Republic Kazakhstan for 2011 - 2020 "and" State programme for the development of health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Densaulyk" for 2016-2019 ", "On approval of the State Programme for the Development of Health Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2025", by-laws of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in accordance with ISO 9001: 2015.

Since 2006, KazNMU started training bachelors, since 2007 - masters and since 2009 - PhD doctoral students. Currently, in accordance with the state license No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated 19.09.2019. training is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English languages at the undergraduate and postgraduate levels of education.

The university successfully implements dual education involving employers in the development and implementation of educational programmes and field training for interns and residents in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, branches of KazNMU in Taldykorgan, Taraz and Kyzylorda and other regions of Kazakhstan.

In KazNMU from 2016 to 2020, 5422 people received postgraduate education, including 4356 interns, 322 undergraduates, 122 doctoral students, 719 residents.

Employment of graduates of the magistracy of KazNMU in 2017-2018 academic year was 100%, in 2018 -2019 academic year - 100%, in 2019 - 2020 academic. year - 96%.

In accordance with the Strategy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU for 2019 - 2023. the basis of KazNMU's activity is the trinity: the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities, in order to provide high-quality and modern medical care to the population and training of professional personnel (<u>https://kaznmu.kz/rus/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu/</u>).

The university has 13 academic buildings with a total area of 64,601.2 square meters, a gym, 7 dormitories for 2860 places with a total area of 25,559.2 square meters (until 2018).

In 2018, at the expense of the university, a new dormitory for 512 places was opened. The structure of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU included republican state enterprises: Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, gynaecology and Perinatology; Scientific Centre for Pediatric and Pediatric Surgery; Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine; Kazakh Scientific Research Institute of Oncology and Scientific Centre of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov.

KazNMU conducts training for students on the basis of 108 clinics, polyclinics, research institutes, scientific centres, including 6 affiliated with the university - 5 scientific research institutes and scientific centres (scientific centre named after A.N. Syzganov, SCOGP, SCPPS, KSRICIM, KRIOR, as well as 1 UK) ... The structure of the united University clinic includes: clinic "Aksai", clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

The staff of the University is 2993 people. Of these, the teaching staff - 1283, including academicians - 9, doctors of sciences - 151, candidates of sciences - 401, PhD doctors - 20. Holders of the grant of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "The best teacher of the Republic of Kazakhstan" are 21 university teachers.

Since 2018, KazNMU has a certificate of institutional accreditation for 5 years. KazNMU is one of the founders of the "Academic Demanding" league, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty.

KazNMU is a member of the following international associations: The Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE); Association Siberian Open University; UNAI - United Nations Academic Impact Programme.

During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 140 agreements on cooperation with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 35 countries of near and far abroad have been

concluded. Within the Erasmus + programme signed agreements with European universities - Finland, Lithuania, Spain, Estonia, Italy.

In 2012, the Dissertation Council began operating in KazNMU for conferring a PhD degree in the specialty "Public Health", in subsequent years in the specialties "Medicine", "Technology of pharmaceutical production", "Nursing".

In 2016, within the framework of grant funding (MoH RK, MES RK), 7 research projects were carried out in the amount of 57090.0 million tenge. 43 projects financed by other sources (foreign, intra-university, domestic, as initiative ones) in the amount of 256372.6 million tenge. In 2017, there were 12 projects in total, of which - 1 within the framework of programme-targeted funding (MHSD RK, MES RK), 7 - within the framework of grant funding (MoH RK, MES RK), 4 - with other sources of funding for a total of 75 8804.2 million tenge. In 2018, there were also 11 projects, of which 1 within the framework of programme-targeted financing (MHSD RK, MES RK), 6 - within the framework of grant financing (MOH RK, MES RK), 6 - within the framework of 106,559 million tenge. In 2019, 14 projects, including 1 within the framework of grant financing (MoH RK, MES RK), 5 - within the framework of grant financing (MoH RK, MES RK), 8 - with other sources of financing for a total amount of 65,923 million tenge.

Operational and communicative competencies in the educational model of KazNMU are practiced at the Simulation Centre named after K. Kozhakanov, which was updated in 2020 through the acquisition of modern high-tech simulators and dummies.

Thus, KazNMU is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible university, a leader in Central Asia in the multi-level training of competitive healthcare and pharmacy specialists through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical and pharmaceutical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific potential.

At KazNMU, training at the bachelor's and internship levels in the specialty "General Medicine" is coordinated by the School of General Medicine-1, School of General Medicine-2, the International Faculty, the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. The dean's office for master's and doctoral studies coordinates master's studies.

The main task of the magistracy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU is to provide the university with its own qualified personnel. In KazNMU from 2016 to 2020, 322 undergraduates received postgraduate education.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the Master's degree programme in the specialty "Medicine" was carried out in 2015 by the IAAR.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the Master's degree programme in the specialty "Medicine"

Study Programme Self-Assessment Report presented on 83 pages of the main text, annexes and copies or electronic versions of 15 documents on the organization of education, located at the link (www.kaznmu.kz,).

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of information provided by the accredited educational programme. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the selfassessment of the educational programme Master's programme "Medicine", the dean of the faculty N. Ivanchenko.

Self-assessment of educational programmes of KazNMU carried out on the basis of order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparing for

accreditation educational programmes in the specialty "Medicine" (bachelor's, master's, doctoral PhD).

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analysed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for programmes of higher and postgraduate education of medical educational organizations(hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of the Master's degree programme "Medicine" of KazNMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of the NU " Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care " No. 5 dated 17.02. 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 07.12.2020 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector T.S. Nurgozhin...

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and students, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

Access to the Bachelor's Programme "General Medicine" <u>https://drive.google.com/file/d/1espuv4m_RfQdGV33xqw94N0xkaQCGe65/view?ts=5fe2b480</u>, the master's degree was <u>https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/16BBS0ga</u> ErhurgJa12bhhc1s2JmZX0QTf? Usp = sharing_eil & ts = 5fe184c8 and doctoral programme <u>https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1mRnHTjzuAqIwDUhgOEzZ7pVglZLfyqGY</u>

The KazNMU staff ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the Eurasian Accreditation Centre and the EQEH and in the appendix to this report.

An interview with the management - vice-rector Bayeldinova K. Zh. and key employees of KazNMU made it possible to determine the fulfilment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches to the development of the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university until 2023, the role and place of higher and postgraduate clinical education in the university strategy (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialty "Medicine" clinical bases (more than 100) and qualified teachers, guarantees of the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurement and concluding agreements with country and international partners (108 contracts).

Interview with the dean of magistracy and doctoral studies Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna made it possible to determine that the management of programmes is carried out at a qualitative level, the dean is aware of all the problems and successes of students, maintains regular communication with them, especially in the context of distance learning during a pandemic, 100% of undergraduates defend dissertations, however, not every doctoral students completes the programme with a dissertation. 20 undergraduates are currently participating in the implementation of scientific and technical projects. So, for example, in the programme-target project of the Ministry of Health of the

Republic of Kazakhstan "New molecular genetic methods of pre-symptomatic diagnostics and methods of treatment of a number of significant diseases", 2017-2019, the head of Ramazanova BA, 18 undergraduates participated. The participation of a large number of undergraduates in research projects is necessary to improve their scientific knowledge,

The meetings with the heads of departments in accordance with the programme of the visit of the EEC contributed to the verification of the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme, since the heads of the relevant departments gave specific and clear explanations to the experts' questions.

A survey of KazNMU resources - a visit to the library, the test centre and the registrar's office was aimed at verifying the data in Section 6 (Educational Resources) of the self-assessment report. The library has a large collection of literature in three languages, only 4 floors (the last one serves senior students and teachers). Students are provided with a sufficient amount of educational literature, there is access to 12 databases of professional and scientific literature, which was demonstrated to the experts by the director Modov Nurbol Alimbaevich. Library employee G.A. Zhanbolatova monthly monitoring of the use of electronic resources and the capabilities of foreign databases is carried out. During the visit, the problems of the library were voiced - the need to update office equipment, the introduction of informatization in the process of submitting applications and issuing textbooks to students, creation of a student discussion room, renovation of the library halls and recreations. The test centre visited by EEC is located on the 2nd floor of building No. 2, where 192 computer places are located, there are 5 air conditioners, video surveillance, however, metrological expertise has never been carried out. In the period before the pandemic, the workload of the test centre was daily from 8.00 to 18.00, while the centre has 4 employees and teachers of departments are involved as observers of the testing process. The head of the test centre Shonbasova Maral Beibitshanovna said that with a large number of students at once, inappropriate climatic conditions in the premises of the centre take place. Then the EEC visited the office of the registrar, where the logs of registration of examination sheets were reviewed, a conversation was held with the head of Nabieva G.S.

An interview with the chairman, deputy chairman and secretary of the Dissertation Council (DS) PhD in Medicine included questions about the possibility of defending dissertations in English (2 defenses passed in 2019), presenting a monograph as a dissertation work (until now, there was no), the mechanism refusal to defend a dissertation (there was also no DS during the period of work of this DS), flexible structure of DS (three permanent members and other participants are invited depending on the direction of the dissertation), foreign participation in the DS work, the quality of dissertations. Baskakova I.V. the presentation of the DS was presented, which contained information on a number of experts' questions.

The interview with the chairmen of the CEP (4) included questions about the mechanisms for reviewing and approving educational programmes (the first stage at the department level), approving teaching aids, about the responsibility of the CEP for the quality of programmes, monitoring the educational process - carried out in conjunction with working groups, also created Commission under the Academic Council, introduced checklists for checking syllabuses, a checklist for assessing a teacher. Other issues of the EEC were related to the distribution of responsibilities among the members of the CEP. Within the CEP there are 5 working groups on quality (improvement and implementation of new educational programmes, development and examination of CIS, feedback form, monitoring of the educational process, monitoring of innovation and publishing).

Mentors of undergraduates are teachers of clinical bases with extensive experience in working with this contingent. Deputy Deans assist undergraduates in choosing elective disciplines. Curators carry out educational and cultural work among students.

The experts studied in detail the documentation, including the journals of progress and attendance (paper and AIS-KazNMU) working curricula, syllables, control and measuring instruments, exam sheets.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazNMU and the "Department Policies" developed at the departments of the university, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process (QMS has been constantly supported and certified since 2012).

Within the framework of the Erasmus + programme, agreements have been signed with European universities: Finland, Lithuania, Spain, Estonia. 124 cooperation agreements have been concluded with universities in 34 countries. NJSC "KazNMU" is an institutional member of 7 international associations. NJSC "KazNMU" is one of the founders of the League of "Academic Demanding", the purpose of which is to improve the quality of education.

The university has three laboratories: a republican-level collective use centre (a genomic laboratory equipped with PCR equipment), a scientific clinical diagnostic laboratory (licensed), a scientific and educational laboratory equipped with instruments and standardized equipment. A vivarium with laboratory animals has been preserved: rats, mice and rabbits, which are necessary, for example, for scientific research.

When performing master's theses, it is desirable to expand the performance of scientific research in these laboratories.

At the university, in order to improve the scientific activities of the teaching staff at the master's level, the classroom load for teachers has been reduced to 500 hours per year, which made it possible to engage in science during the freed hours.

This day was devoted to an interview with the director of the simulation centre Tolkimbaeva N.A. and a virtual tour of the centre. Then there was a visitNIIFM named after B.A. Atchabarov andOf the Institute of Dentistry of KazNMU, which are the basis for the research practice of undergraduates and doctoral students, as well as clinical bases of accredited programmes, including scientific centres and research institutes affiliated with KazNMU (Simulation center of KazNMU with an area of 3.5 thousand square meters, City Cardiology Centre, PSE on the REM "Ambulance Service", Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, Medical centre "ASMED-2", SPE on the REM (City Polyclinic No. 26). At clinical sites, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with disciplines and level of education, accessibility for teachers and students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

So, at the department of emergency medical care, there are training rooms for students, and rooms for practical skills, which are equipped with special equipment and dummies. The department is adapted to the remote format of organizing training for students (teachers are trained in making videos, principles of DLT, proctoring in July-November 2020) and apply these technologies in the educational process during a pandemic. Specialists of practical health care with extensive work experience work at the department as part-time workers and mentors. There is a very large competition for employment in this specialty, there are a large number of people wishing to work in the ambulance service.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, interviews were held with 62 undergraduates and doctoral students (on-line) and off-line were attended by Olga Petrova (undergraduate), Primbaeva Altynay (undergraduate), Askar Yeulik (doctoral student), Turekulova Aigerim (doctoral student), Fakhtoradiev Ildar (included issues of interaction with foreign leaders, the choice of a scientific supervisor, the complexity of recruiting material for research, about foreign internships, about the scientific research bases of the university, academic mobility, features of the distance learning format.

Interviews with 77 teachers of bachelor's and internship (on-line), as well as master's programmes included the following questions: material and moral incentives, academic load, financing of intra-university projects, implementation of KPIs of teaching staff.

The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

In interviews with 8 employers (online), experts asked the following questions: participation in the development of the mission of the educational programme, what proposals were made to improve educational programmes, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of students and graduates of KazNMU, participation in teaching through mentoring, on the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates, etc.

Interview with 21 graduates of the master's and doctoral studies (online) included questions: difficulties in finding a job, choosing a place of work, feedback from the university after employment, whether the knowledge gained at the university helped in practical activities, the weaknesses of studying at the university, the desire to continue studies at this university. The experts received full answers to all questions.

The experts examined the documentation on the accredited educational programme both in electronic form using the links provided, and at the request of experts during a visit to KazNMU, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, a plan for 5 years, an annual plan for the 2019-2020 academic year and a report for 2019, a progress journal, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with students, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and measures taken, the code of ethics and others, control and measuring instruments), including documentation (themes of scientific and technological progress, a list of supervisors of undergraduates, compliance with their qualification requirements, a report on indicators of scientific activity) at the request of EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. Experts have individually completed the "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria for the Master's degree programme" Medicine "for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairman of the EEC prof. Kuzgibekova Almagul Bolatovna held a final open vote on recommendations for KazNMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the Chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment within the framework of the accreditation of the educational programme of the magistracy "Medicine".

Recommendations:

- 1. To better master the skills of scientific research, it is necessary to involve as many master students as possible in the implementation of scientific and technical programmes.
- 2. Expand and widely use the university's own laboratories when conducting research projects by undergraduates.

Results of the survey. An observer from ECAQA on 20-21.12.2020 conducted an online survey of students and teachers of KazNMU on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>...

In total, answers were received - 12 undergraduates (Master's degree) (out of 13), doctoral students 81 (out of 84), teachers - 360.

They also analysed the results of an independent student analysis on 78 questions, which was organized by the university itself. The questionnaires included 78 questions.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate satisfactory management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of organizing training, at the same time, almost all respondents show a level of complete satisfaction from 57 to 72% in key areas related to educational programmes: organization of the educational process, schedule, methods of assessment, fairness of assessment of students, equipment of classrooms, availability of resources of clinical bases, library fund, communication with teachers and university management. The results of the questionnaire made it possible to identify areas for improvement (programmes of material and social support for teachers, availability of leadership and administration for teachers and students, clinical work).

In the survey, 12 undergraduates of the 2nd year of study were accepted. According to the results of the survey, the respondents noted the strengths of the university: 100% of the respondents noted support from scientific leaders in the implementation of research, 91.67% noted that the teaching staff respects students, the methods of assessing knowledge and skills are fair, the same percentage was noted by master students of their involvement in activities for the preparation of specialized accreditation. At the same time, only 75% of students are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 25% are only partially satisfied. Thus, the results of the questionnaire survey confirm that the undergraduates are generally satisfied with almost all assessment criteria.

Conclusion from the external evaluation:

The EEC members have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of KazNMU was analysed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the accuracy of the information provided to KazNMU and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that KazNMU described its best practice in compliance with accreditation standards in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, during the external expert evaluation, the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, checklists, undergraduate portfolios, individual undergraduate plans for the 2019-2020 academic year, teacher publications, rules for admission to magistracy, personnel policy, internal system programme quality assurance, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available to students to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature, selection criteria for scientific advisors of undergraduates, indicators of the university's scientific activity, participation of undergraduates in the implementation of scientific and technical progress), which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the Master's degree programme in the specialty "Medicine" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on December 24, 2020.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the KazNMU team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in full in accordance

with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for postgraduate education of KazNMU employees, departments, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme Master's degree in Medicine, KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

The mission of the University was first formulated in 2012, revised in 2017. The latest revision of the university's mission, in connection with obtaining the status of a research university and the developed Development Programme for 2019-2023. was updated and approved by the Decision of the Supervisory Board of KazNMU (Protocol No. 1 dated 20.03.2019).

Mission of the Asfendiyarov KazNMU is aimed at serving the society through the training of competitive specialists in the treatment, preservation and strengthening of people's health, improving health care through the integration of advanced educational, scientific and medical technologies".

KazNMU has defined its mission, goals and vision for the future. The mission and goals are widely accepted and supported by the administration, university staff, teaching staff, students. Information about the mission and goals is available to all interested parties. The stated mission and goals correspond to the available resources and capabilities of the University: production and clinical bases, laboratories, Centre for Simulations and Communication Skills, library, AIS, etc.

The goal of the Master's degree programme in Medicine is to train professionally qualified healthcare professionals in demand in the labour market of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which corresponds to the mission and goals of KazNMU, the charter of the organization of education, reflect the main areas of activity, presented in the Strategic Development Plan of the Kazakh National Medical University. S. D. Asfendiyarov (approved by the rector and agreed upon by the decision of the Supervisory Board, Protocol No. 3 dated 30.05.2018).

At NJSC "KazNMU", the master's programme in the specialty "Medicine" is structured in such a way as to provide a holistic systematic understanding of the processes of research and teaching activities and teach how to use modern tools for solving strategic and tactical tasks that are universal throughout the world.

The educational programme is based on the possibility of implementing individual educational trajectories, strengthening interdisciplinary learning within the framework of the tasks of implementing the corresponding priority areas of development with the possibility of transforming individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies.

Graduates of the master's programme of this programme have the opportunity to implement in the following areas of professional activity: medical education, medical science and medical practice.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

Strengths:

- **1.** The presence of a university mission and educational programme, showing a strategic vision and development prospects.
- **2.** Employment of graduates of magistracy at KazNMU over the past 3 years is on average 98.7%, which speaks of the demand for masters.
- **3.** In November 2019, KazNMU became the owner of the independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among

medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan" according to the international information and analytical platform Web of Science.

4. Participation in the discussion of the mission, both internal and external stakeholders.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out 5 standards conform: completely - 5, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

The main goal of the educational programme in the specialty "Medicine" is to train personnel for the system of higher and postgraduate education, research sector and practical health care, with in-depth scientific and pedagogical training.

Modular educational programmes enable undergraduates to plan and implement an individual, targeted learning path throughout their studies.

Educational programmes of postgraduate education are provided with the following auxiliary "tools": working curriculum, academic calendar, individual curriculum and individual work plan of the master's student. Working curriculum and academic calendars are developed by the department of magistracy and doctoral studies for the academic year on the basis of the Model curriculum approved at a meeting of the Senate. To monitor the implementation of the individual master's work plan, which includes both monitoring of progress and compliance with the deadlines for writing a dissertation work, each master's student is given a journal "Individual master's work plan", where the student keeps records throughout the learning process as they are completed.

Teachers of the University at all levels of education are doing a lot of work to introduce new forms and methods of teaching, means of enhancing cognitive activity into the educational process: - multimedia lectures; problem- based lectures (PBL); Case- based Learning (CBL) incl. analysis of specific cases (ASC or case study); team-based learning (TBL), incl. work in small groups; role-playing, business games; creative tasks (videos, crosswords, quizzes, etc.); the use of problematic and situational tasks in practical training; - e-learning.

The University has created conditions for training in programmes of both incoming and outgoing academic mobility.

Within the framework of academic mobility, annual foreign internships for students are provided. Internships are held on the basis of agreements with foreign university partners.

To control and assess the quality of teaching, mutual visits to classes, open classes of teachers are held, the results of which are discussed at meetings of departments, the Faculty Council. The quality of classes and the teaching materials used, the timeliness of assignments to the SIW, the organization of monitoring and assessment of students' progress is analysed at meetings of the departments and the Faculty Council.

The University has developed a standard "Feedback Monitoring". Feedback from the teacher to undergraduates is provided during and at the end of each practical lesson, in the process of scoring in the assessment headings.

The trajectory of training undergraduates is implemented in the course of a free choice of elective disciplines, taking into account the topic of research work.

Participants of the educational process, undergraduates and teaching staff of the university have a direct interest in the implementation of the educational programme, and can express their opinion by using the boxes of trust or the rector's blog.

The practice bases provide undergraduates with the opportunity to complete the practice programme, create the necessary conditions, have a material and technical base that meets the current sanitary and technical standards and ensures all types of theoretical and practical training provided for by the curriculum, as well as the effective implementation of the research work of the undergraduate. Research work is an integral part of mastering the master's educational programme and is aimed at forming a student's value attitude to research activities, mastering the system of knowledge and skills in the field of methodology and research methods, and forming research experience.

An electronic resource such as an electronic library helps to ensure the organization of operational scientific activities. Computer classes are widely available for undergraduates. Library KazNMU them. S. D. Asfendiyarova has an information website (http://lib.kaznmu.kz/).

Strengths:

1. In NJSC "KazNMU" Master's programme in the specialty "Medicine"

provides a holistic systemic understanding of the processes of research and pedagogical activity, which allows masters to widely use their knowledge in practice.

- 2. The educational programme is based on the possibility of implementing individual educational trajectories, strengthening interdisciplinary learning.
- 3. In the library of the University there is an automated library system "KABIS", which includes the automation of library processes and the provision of remote access to the electronic catalog fund via the Internet.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 18, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To better master the skills of scientific research, it is necessary to involve as many undergraduates as possible in the implementation of scientific and technical programmes.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING

The system of monitoring the academic achievements of undergraduates at KazNMU includes: current and midterm monitoring of progress, intermediate certification and final state certification.

The assessment of the educational achievements of undergraduates is carried out on the basis of indicators of the level of formation of competencies developed by departments / modules in various forms: control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options of correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, tasks and other works.

The university operates an automated information system "Sirius" designed to automate the management of processes (educational, administrative, organizational, accounting and analytical) in educational institutions of all levels (kindergarten, school, college, university, academy, university), based on the use of standardized electronic documents by departments and the introduction of new educational information technologies in the management of the educational process.

The University uses additional methods for evaluating undergraduates, such as portfolio, evaluation of the performance of scientific research. Assessment methods are developed by the department and reflected in the syllabuses approved at the meeting and by the department and the CEP.

After the exams, a questionnaire survey of undergraduates is carried out to study their opinions about the quality of teaching the discipline, the exam procedure, the results of the sessions are analysed by the department and the department of magistracy and doctoral studies.

In order to objectify the assessment process, independent experts are involved. When conducting the final state attestation to assess the educational achievements of undergraduates, external examiners, as well as specialists in related disciplines, are involved in the commission.

The improvement of the teaching competencies of the teaching staff is carried out by the Course of Pedagogical Skills in full accordance with the developed author's "Model of KazNMU Teacher Competencies" (Certificate of state registration of rights to the copyright object No. 0064 dated January 13, 2016).

Strengths:

- 1. Electronic system "Sirius", providing transparency and speed of recording the results of assessment of students.
- **2.** A system for evaluating educational programmes through the involvement of stakeholders, starting with departments, CEP, Academic Council, external expert evaluation and participation of employers' representatives in examination boards and audits.
- **3.** According to the survey results, 91.67% of undergraduates note fair methods of assessing knowledge and skills.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria: Out of 10 standards conform: completely - 10, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 4: STUDENTS

According to the mission of Asfendiyarov KazNMU policy and criteria for admission to the magistracy are drawn up taking into account the graduation of undergraduates who are able to make an intellectual contribution to the management technologies of the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

One of the key competencies formed within the framework of training undergraduates of KazNMU named after S. D. Asfendiyarov, is the competence "Continuous professional education and development throughout life." This competence is formed in the process of mastering the disciplines of basic and specialized components, as well as research practice, the work of a master's student on a dissertation, and foreign scientific internships.

After the completion of the learning process, a master's student who studied under the State educational order must submit an application from the place of the planned work to the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies for its distribution. If the master's student was unable to provide such an application, the commission for the distribution of graduates, organized by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, independently distributes it to organizations that are interested in such personnel.

The resources of KazNMU, the teaching staff of the departments, the number and powerful material and technical equipment of clinical bases, the professionalism of practical health care workers allow to ensure balance and opportunities for training and recruitment of students.

To implement the competence-oriented Model of medical education in KazNMU, the university operates a system of academic counselling for undergraduates by a scientific supervisor who participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, guides the educational and scientific activities of the student, and assists in employment.

For personal growth and development, in addition to 28 student organizations, sports sections and creative teams, the university has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% WIFI coverage of the university territory, library, computer labs, reconstructed and improved areas of the main buildings).

To develop the intellectual level of undergraduates, expand knowledge in various scientific fields, undergraduates take an active part in the annual final scientific student conference for the Day of Science, in addition, they participate in the traditional Days of the University (December), conferences of the republican and international levels.

Strengths:

1. Annually, the university holds an "Open Day", where the applicant is explained all the information on the rules of admission to the master's programme and the educational programme, as well as on the quality of education, the employment programme, and the research environment of the university.

2. The implementation of educational programmes of higher education is ensured by the free access of each master's student to information resources and library funds, by the availability of

teaching aids and recommendations for all modules, disciplines and all types of educational work.

3. Undergraduates are involved in the work of CEPs, commissions for evaluating the EP, participate in the volunteer movement.

4. The right to independently choose the scientific advisor and the topic of the dissertation work. 5.100% of undergraduates note the support from the scientific advisor when implementation of research and development.

6. fast employment or continuing education in doctoral studies.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 12 standards conform: fully - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 5: STAFFING

KazNMU applies effective and open criteria for recruitment and appointment to teaching positions and guarantees equal opportunities for recruitment, consistent with legal requirements and any other selection criteria.

The departments where master's students are trained have a sufficient number of teachers in accordance with the needs of the programme, mission, successful implementation of the master's educational programme. Scientific supervisors meet the qualification requirements.

The main task of the healthcare industry is determined by the creation and development of its own scientific and innovative potential, as well as the selection of employees with already formed motivation that meets the requirements of the workplace.

The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total volume of the academic load. An obligatory requirement for teachers to conduct classes for undergraduates is the availability of an academic title and work experience.

The requirements of personnel policy for the teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in the magistracy comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU, "Rules for the search, selection of admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated 09.12.2019.

The improvement of the teaching competencies of the teaching staff is carried out by the Course of Pedagogical Skills in full accordance with the developed author's "Model of KazNMU Teacher Competencies" (Certificate of state registration of rights to the copyright object No. 0064 dated January 13, 2016). <u>https://kaznmu.kz/rus/proveden-kurs-po-povysheniju-pedagogich/</u>...

The management of the University, the department of magistracy and doctoral studies, recognizes the merits of the academic activities of teachers who effectively implement the educational programme of the master's degree and achieve high end results in pedagogical, research and clinical activities through differentiated pay and in the form of awards.

The system of external assessment, monitoring of the teacher's work and the achievement of the intermediate and final result of the educational programme in the magistracy is carried out through the annual attestation of the teaching staff in all types of activities, including the scientific guidance of undergraduates. The external evaluation system is carried out through the QMS standards.

Strengths:

- 1. All supervisors of undergraduates meet the qualification requirements, according to the State Educational Standard.
- 2. All supervisors of undergraduates have a scientific degree.
- 3. Opportunity for teaching staff to undergo scientific training abroad.

4. All supervisors of undergraduates have GSP (Good Clinical Practice) certificates.

5. To improve the scientific activities of the teaching staff at the master's level, the classroom teaching load for teachers has been reduced to 500 hours per year.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 6, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP

The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, premises for the cultural and social sphere, university clinics, clinical bases - the leading medical clinics in Almaty.

The total fund of the library has more than 1 439 376 copies of literature, of which 2828 on surgical diseases: 2625 in Russian, 175 in Kazakh, 28 in English.

The electronic catalog of the library is available in all educational buildings, as well as on the Internet from the library website (http: // (lib.kaznmu.kz.).

For library and information services, the university annually allocates more than 11 million tenge. For access to world electronic resources in 2017 - 11, 306.106. 75 million tenge, for 2016 - 11, 073, 527.12 million tenge allocated.

Purchase of literature for 2017 over 331 million tenge.

The university has its own laboratories and vivarium, which undergraduates successfully use when carrying out research work.

Due to the introduction of the AIS "Sirius" complex in the university, the improvement of information services for all subjects of the educational process is achieved, in accordance with the requirements for educational institutions.

For students there is a dining room, leisure rooms, museums.

In university hospitals, a safe environment for employees, teachers, students and patients is ensured through compulsory employer liability insurance for employees. Workplaces are certified annually for occupational hazards.

The University administration allocates the necessary funds from the university budget for continuous improvement of the material and technical base.

Constant work is underway to improve IT technologies and university infrastructure. The uninterrupted operation of the Internet, corresponding to the Internet networks of the republic, was ensured, a local computer system, a system of video broadcasting of lectures in classrooms was created.

Strengths:

- 1. The scientific library of KazNMU signed contracts with 9 international companies for access to electronic databases.
- 2. For automation and transparency of the educational process, the AIS Sirius has been introduced at the university.
- 3. Availability of 3 own laboratories and a functioning vivarium.
- 4. Availability of agreements with more than 100 clinical bases at the university.
- 5. In university hospitals, a safe environment for employees, teachers, students and patients is ensured through compulsory employer liability insurance for employees. Work places are certified annually for occupational hazards.
- **6.** Continuous improvement of IT technologies, the university purchased licenses for 3 educational platforms (Teams, Cisco, Zoom) and a modern proctoring system.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 1, significantly - 2, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. It is necessary to expand and widely use the university's own laboratories and vivarium when conducting research work by undergraduates.

Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including the profiling / graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational programme in the magistracy, DAR, the Academic Committee, the Senate, the student government, the Centre for the admission and vocational guidance of students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through stakeholder surveys (employers, professional associations and trainees.

At the profile CEP, there is a working group on educational programmes that check the draft EP for the current CEP, after which they agree with the chairman of the CEP and discuss the EP with stakeholders (employers, professional associations and trainees) In the subsequent OP is discussed by the academic committee in the Senate, after which it is approved.

One of the important conditions for continuous monitoring and improving the quality of the educational process is its correction based on feedback with the participation of stakeholders.

Most of the undergraduates who left their comments on improving the learning process in the magistracy most often talk about an increase in the proportion of independence in the implementation of the programme. There were no particularly critical remarks and opinions.

Customer feedback is maintained in each structural unit. According to the requirements of the QMS, each structural unit has a box for complaints and suggestions, a performance improvement log (form 19) is kept, which records all inconsistencies, claims, consumer complaints, their reasons, and the implementation of corrective actions.

Teachers, undergraduates, employers have the opportunity to participate in the assessment and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through various feedback channels.

Strengths:

- 1. KazNMU systematically collects, analyses feedback, through questionnaires of teachers and students, which are held twice a year during the winter and summer sessions.
- 2. A survey with employers is conducted annually.
- 3. Undergraduates and employers are members of the CEP.
- **4.** According to the results of a survey of undergraduates by the university, 90% of undergraduates noted the principle of equality in learning.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 8 standards conform: fully - 8, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

The general management of the EP implementation is carried out by the supervising vicerector. At meetings with postgraduate students, the vice-rector maintains regular feedback on design issues in the formation of IEP, planning scientific internships, academic mobility, etc., management and evaluation of master's programmes (meetings with teaching staff, meetings, questionnaires).

The University pursues an active innovation policy aimed at creating the necessary conditions for practice-oriented training of students based on the integration of the educational process, scientific potential and practical health care.

Teachers follow the innovative principle of implementing 3 key points in teaching undergraduates: the development of individual and group responsibility, the use of assignments that

connect and mutually reinforce individual, group work and discussion in the classroom, the use of clinical situations that stimulate the exchange of views within and between groups.

Teaching staff, staff, students and representatives of practical health care are involved in the process of managing educational programmes through their inclusion in advisory bodies. The teaching staff are responsible for the high-quality preparation of the educational programme, and the management of the university for the allocation of resources necessary for its implementation.

Each teacher registers on the site and has a personal account, which is a tool that allows the teaching staff to enter, edit and store information about educational and scientific activities.

In accordance with the academic mobility programme and the visiting programme at the expense of various funds of the university, undergraduates have the opportunity to participate in lectures by foreign professors and go to study on academic mobility.

The calculation of the teaching load of the teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 20, 2013 No. 499) and the state education standard (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 387 dated July 29, 2009 and Order No. 647 dated July 31, 2015) and in the magistracy - 500 hours per year (order No. 7 dated 09/08/2015).

Based on the results of key performance indicators of the teaching staff, differentiated wages are paid.

Strengths:

- 1. The main structural divisions of the University are institutes, deans of the School, departments, departments, centers that coordinate the overall academic work at the university.
- 2. Currently, KazNMU has created and successfully operates a system of internal control through the activities of internal auditors who check the activities of structural units for compliance with the QMS requirements of international quality standards.
- 3. Material assistance is provided to teachers (according to the trade union system), the scientific activities of the teaching staff are stimulated (payment for articles with a high impact factor, participation in scientific and technical progress, intra-university grants), which affects the introduction of innovations in the educational process in the magistracy.
- 4. A new function of dean's offices for the distribution of funds has been introduced, depending on the needs of structural units.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 19 standards conform: fully - 17, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 8: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Standard 9: PROGRAMME RENEWAL

In order to monitor the quality of educational services and improve it, questionnaires of students are conducted to identify the needs of stakeholders, to study the quality of education processes, to improve and improve the activities of all departments of the university. The questionnaire procedure is carried out systematically throughout the entire training period. The questionnaires can be of different designs, depending on the category of respondents.

Thus, the survey of undergraduates is one of the mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of the educational programmes being implemented, which ensures the quality of the programme management process. The achievement of final results by students is also a mechanism for assessing the educational programme and the progress of students, since they are fairly valid and reliable methods and require basic data on the educational programme.

KazNMU conducts an annual assessment of the literature and equipment of the library fund for medical postgraduate education, while planning and applying the monitoring, measurement, analysis and improvement processes necessary to demonstrate compliance with the requirements.

Improvement of the target indicators of the Strategic directions of the university development to improve the quality of postgraduate education, the development of science and practice in the field of scientific and innovative activities is carried out on the basis of an analysis of the scientific achievements of undergraduates regarding the mission of the university and the final learning outcomes.

Strengths:

- 1. Questionnaires of students are regularly carried out to identify the needs of stakeholders, to study the quality of education processes, improve and improve the activities of all departments of the university.
- 2. The participation of students in the assessment of the educational programme also contributes to the improvement of student self-government in the university.
- 3. Feedback from employers and other interested parties is monitored and is the basis for revising the goals, objectives and activities of the University and the content of the EP.
- 4. The content of both compulsory and elective disciplines is adjusted annually, the results of teacher training are introduced.
- 5. The university provides for joint educational programmes with foreign universities.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed **There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.**

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfilment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analysing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the Master in the specialty "Medicine" KazNMU:

1. To better master the skills of scientific research, it is necessary to involve as many undergraduates as possible in the implementation of scientific and technical programmes.

2. It is necessary to expand and widely use the university's own laboratories and

vivarium when conducting research work by undergraduates.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the master's degree program in the specialty "Medicine" for a period of 5 years **Chairman**

Kuzgibekova Almagul Bolatovna **Foreign expert** Uryasiev Oleg Mikhailovich **Academic expert** Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna **Academic expert** Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna **Representative of undergraduates** Khusainova Zhanar Zhanatbekovna **ECAQA Observer** Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

A. 61200 AAN

	Evaluation criteria	Evaluation			
Standard		ies	compliant	npliant	ies
	Number of standards = BS*/SU	Fully complies	Largely con	Partially compliant	Fully complies
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	5/0	5	5	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS	19/2	21	18	3
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING	10/0	10	10	
4.	STUDENTS	12/0	12	11	
5.	STAFFING	7/0	7	6	1
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP	4/0	4	1	2
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS	8/0	8	8	
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	19/0	19	17	2
9	PROGRAMME RENEWAL	4/0	4	2	2
	Total:	88/2	90	78	10

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) educational master's programme in the specialty "Medicine" KazNMU

Appendix 2.

Ν	Names of documents	amount
0.		
1.	Monitoring the employment of graduates	3
2.	The list of scientific and technical programmes carried out by the university (PCF, programme-targeted, intra-university)	1
3.	List of undergraduates participating in STP	1
4.	Indicators of the implementation of scientific activities of the university	3
5.	Title of topics of master's thesis	2
6.	List of scientific advisers of undergraduates	2
7.	Agreements with clinical bases	10
8.	Modular educational master's programmes	3
9.	Research practice data for undergraduates	2
10.	Information on the teaching practice of undergraduates	2
11.	Individual plans of undergraduates	12
12.	Professional development of teaching staff	3
13.	Foreign scientific internships of teaching staff	2
14.	The teaching load of the teaching staff of the magistracy	3
15.	CEP meeting protocol	7
16.	Results of the questionnaire survey of the QMS of the university	3
17.	Orders approved by scientific advisors of undergraduates	2
18.	Extracts from the Academic Council for the approval of the topics of	2
	master's theses	
19.	Order for mentors of clinical bases	2